

Best Practices in Hiring

August 26, 2016

Margaret Farrar, Dean, College of Arts and Sciences

Terry Mills, Assistant Provost for Diversity and Inclusion

Colleen Treml, General Counsel

Kenneth Danton, Assistant General Counsel

Alex Teodosio, Assistant Vice President of Human Resources

Lori Sprague, Assistant Director of Human Resources

Opening and Introduction



Diversity & JCU Strategic Plan

Hiring for mission and strategic plan:

“John Carroll University welcomes all expressions of diversity that are in keeping with the Ignatian tradition of fostering an inclusive, compassionate, and respectful environment for our students, faculty, staff, administrators, and guests.”

1. Academic Excellence for Student Learning and Success.
2. Faith That Does Justice by addressing social challenges facing our local and global communities through the Ignatian model of reflection and action.
3. Engaged Campus Community challenges us to sustain a dynamic and collaborative workplace by embracing the Ignatian ideal of Magis, the greater good.

Diversity & JCU Strategic Plan

Some Food for Thought:

- Research shows that diverse working groups are more productive, creative, and innovative than homogeneous groups.
- Developing a diverse faculty will enhance teaching and research (Herring, 2009; Chang et al., 2003; ACE and AAUP, 2000).
- All individuals have unconscious biases that can impact what they see as a “good fit” for a given position or work environment.

Diversity & JCU Strategic Plan

Some Food for Thought:

- Committee members should seek to understand attitudes that might impact a selection process, even unintentionally.
- It is also important to structure the search process to minimize the impact of such bias.
- In addition to individual biases, structural biases might also exist in a given profession or discipline.
- Committee members might consider what those issues may be and how their impact can be lessened.

Diversity & JCU Strategic Plan

Some Food for Thought:

- Individual candidates might have concerns related to feeling welcomed in a Department, College, or University in general.
- We can address some of these concerns through expressing our strong commitment to diversity, and to broad outreach to identify a diverse pool of candidates.

Diversity & JCU Strategic Plan

Some Food for Thought:

- Remind your search committee that they represent the interests of the department as a whole and, in a broader context, the interests of the University.
- Stress that failure to recruit and fairly evaluate a diverse pool of candidates may jeopardize the search; that it may be too late to address the issue when and if you are asked, “Why are there no women or minorities on your finalist list?”

The Top 10 – Legal Do's and Don'ts For Hiring

No. 1 – Don't Make Assumptions About What is Diversity

- Title VII, ADEA and ADA: non-discrimination based on race, color, national origin, religion, sex, age and disability.
- Considering diversity is acceptable.
- Issues: assuming an applicant is diverse, or assuming a particular race/national origin/gender is needed in the department or university
- Generally cannot seek 1 race or national origin or gender, or prefer a subgroup or national origin within a group

No. 2 – Don't Select Based on Demographics As A General Matter

- Law generally does not permit hiring based on race, color, national origin, gender, or other similar demographic.
- Selection should be based on evaluating the candidates' materials, interview, references, etc. vs. written job requirements.
- Can consider diversity in all facets
- Exception: As a federal contractor, the affirmative action plan specifies when the university can consider underutilization at JCU vs. availability in discipline nationally.

No. 3 – Do Increase Your Applicant Pool

- Goal is to increase size and diversity of applicant pool
- Conduct active and targeted recruitment
- If applicant pool is broader and more diverse, selection will be more diverse.
- Consider utilizing conferences, contacts, and associations.

No. 4 – Do Consider Diversity in All Forms

- JCU's Diversity Statement identifies the following dimensions of diversity that the institution seeks to reflect through its curriculum, programs and recruitment: Race, Age, Ethnicity, Disability, Gender, Nationality, Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity, Socioeconomic Background, Veteran Status, Religion or Spiritual Affiliation, and Intellectual Perspective.
- JCU seeks to recruit instructors who have a demonstrated ability to work with diverse students, using a similarly broad definition for diversity.
- We have provided sample language of options for defensible ways to consider diversity as a hiring criteria.

No. 5 – Do Establish a Process and Follow it

- Procedural irregularities often are the basis for discrimination cases in the academic environment.
- Since courts are generally hesitant to upend the academic judgment in faculty decision-making, legal challenges to such decisions often rely on procedural irregularities as a basis for establishing that the process was unfair or for an inference of discrimination.
- Irregularities with the intent to help a candidate can result in the individual complaining of discrimination or an irregular process, and/or other applicants complaining about the irregularity too.

No. 6 – Do Document Your Process

- Clear contemporaneous documentation of the decision-making process helps to substantiate how and why the department made its hiring decision. Tools such as consistent criteria-based evaluations of candidates are also useful in documenting hiring decisions.
- Legal or internal procedural challenges can take a significant amount of time. Memories can fade or be unreliable.
- Don't be shy about documenting the rationale for your decisions, but do remember that others may judge the situation almost entirely on the basis of your writings.

No. 7 – Do Be Fair and Consistent In Process and Interview Questions

- Ensure that the process is fair and all important elements (including diversity) are addressed with every candidate by being consistent with interview questions and topics. Often, this means planning out the major topics/questions in advance.
- Sometimes, unconscious bias can lead interviewers to question different candidates in different ways. Structuring the questioning process can avoid this tendency.
- Consistent questions enable easier comparison, such as when filling out a matrix to evaluate candidates.

No. 8 – Don't Ask Impermissible Questions

- Questions that seek information from an applicant on the individual's or their family's race, color, national origin, religion, sex, age, or disability are unlawful and can lead to an inference that selection was discriminatory.
- For example, these are impermissible:
 - “How has being _____ (race or gender) affected your work?”
 - “Tell me about your family.”
 - “Where are you from and how did you happen to come to the U.S.?”
 - “Are you a U.S. citizen?” (Correct: “Are you authorized to work in the U.S. and have you ever been on a J visa?”)

No. 9 – Don't Feel A Need To Share With Candidates “Why”

- If possible, communicate at the same time with interviewed candidates about the outcome of the search.
- Internal candidates may need to be advised earlier.
- Communication with candidates: basic response can say the department is pursuing other candidates, or that the candidate was not selected for the position
- Avoid discussing with a candidate information about other candidates or specific reasons for non-selection.

No. 10 – Do Maintain the Integrity and Confidentiality of Process

- Only discuss candidates with those involved in the process or as necessary to conduct the search, including comments and votes from other committee members.
- Candidate files, materials and interviews and committee documents/notes should be treated as confidential.
- Be clear with candidates if and when confidentiality can and cannot be maintained.

FINALLY: Do Ask Questions

If you have questions about the hiring process, ask the Dean's Office, Human Resources or Legal Affairs.

Job Descriptions and Advertisements

The Job Description and Advertisement

- A good job description is the key to getting the candidates you want.
- It should include all key qualifications.
- Consider what is required vs. preferred.
- Writing more broadly = a broader applicant pool.
- Include how experience with diversity and diversity factors will be considered as a position qualification.
- The description will guide your fair evaluation of candidates.

The Role of the Search Committee

- Recruiting and advertising widely
- Evaluating candidates fairly and consistently
- Creating a welcoming environment for candidates when they visit
- Helping with onboarding faculty

Tools and Resources: PeopleAdmin

PeopleAdmin allows search committees the ability to create and post positions online.

All members of the search committee are able to the review and assess candidate information online.

Applicants are able to view open positions and submit their CV and supporting materials in multiple formats.

The University is able to more effectively track and report on the make-up and disposition of all applicant pools.

Tools and Resources: PeopleAdmin

www.jcu.edu/hr

Tools and Resources: Future Workshops/Trainings

Information Sessions On:

- “Understanding Diversity & Inclusion” including Unconscious Bias – October 12, 9:00-11:00 AM, LSC Conference Room
- PeopleAdmin – Workshops available from Human Resources as requested by departments
- “FMLA and ADA Supervisory Training” – November 1, 9:00-11:00 AM, LSC Conference Room

Thank you

Margaret Farrar

Dean, College of Arts and Sciences

College of Arts and Sciences

P: 216.397.4215

E: mfarrar@jcu.edu

Terry Mills

Assistant Provost for Diversity and Inclusion

Academic Vice President's Office

P: 216.397.4455

E: tmills@jcu.edu

Alex Teodosio

Assistant VP of Human Resources

Human Resources

P: 216.397.1905

E: ateodosio@jcu.edu

Lori Sprague

Assistant Director of Human Resources

Human Resources

P: 216.397.4962

E: lsprague@jcu.edu

Colleen Trembl

General Counsel

Office of Legal Affairs

P: 216.397.1590

E: ctrembl@jcu.edu

Kenneth Danton

Assistant General Counsel

Office of Legal Affairs

P: 216.397.1994

E: kdanton@jcu.edu